Engage for Equity: Promise of Community Based Participatory Research (CBPR)

Nina Wallerstein
Al Richmond
Shannon Sanchez-Youngman
CBPR Definitions

“A collaborative approach to research that equitably involves all partners in the research process and recognizes the unique strengths that each brings. CBPR begins with a research topic of importance to the community with the aim of combining knowledge and action for social change to improve community health and eliminate health disparities.”  

W.K.K. Kellogg

“Collaborative efforts between multi-sector stakeholders who gather and use research and data to build on the strengths and priorities of the community and use multi-level strategies to improve health & social equity.”

Wallerstein, Duran, Oetzel, Minkler, Nov. 2017
Community Engagement Core
New Mexico UNM CARES Health Disparities Center
http://hsc.unm.edu/programs/nmcareshd/cec.shtml

Not “On”

Not ”For”/“In”

CBPR = “with”
Multi-Year NIH-funding to Develop Science and Policy Implications of CBPR

Stage 1: CBPR Conceptual Model
2006-2009 NIMHD Funding

Stage 2: Surveys / Case Studies
2009-2013 Research for Improved Health

Stage 3: New Measures & Tools
2015-2020 Engage for Equity (E2)
Stage One: CBPR Conceptual Model

Adapted from Wallerstein et al, 2008 & Wallerstein et al, 2018: https://cpr.unm.edu/research-projects/cbpr-project/cbpr-model.html

**Contexts**
- Social & Structural
- Political & Policy
- Health Issue Importance
- Capacity & Readiness
- Collaboration Trust & Mistrust

**Partnership Processes**
- Individual Characteristics
- Relationships
- Partnership Structures
- CBOs
- Agency
- Funders
- Community
- Academic
- Government
- Health Care

**Intervention & Research**
- Processes
- Outputs
- Integrate Community Knowledge
- Culture-Centered Interventions
- Empowering Processes
- Partnership Synergy
- Community Involved in Research
- Appropriate Research Design

**Outcomes**
- Intermediate
  - Policy Environment
  - Sustained Partnership
  - Empowerment
  - Shared Power Relations in Research
  - Cultural Reinforcement
  - Individual / Agency Capacity
  - Research Productivity
- Long-term
  - Community Transformation
  - Social Justice
  - Health / Health Equity

**Contexts**
- Social-Economic Status, Place, History, Environment, Community Safety, Institutional Racism, Culture, Role of Education and Research Institutions
- Political & Policy: National / Local Governance/ Stewardship Approvals of Research; Policy & Funding Trends
- Health Issue: Perceived Severity by Partners
- Collaboration: Historic Trust/Mistrust between Partners
- Capacity: Community History of Organizing / Academic Capacity / Partnership Capacity

**Partnership Structures**
- Diversity: Who is Involved
- Complexity
- Formal Agreements
- Control of Resources
- % Dollars to Community
- CBPR Principles
- Partnership Values
- Bridging Social Capital
- Time in Partnership

**Individual Characteristics**
- Motivation to Participate
- Cultural Identities/Humility
- Personal Beliefs/Values
- Spirituality
- Reputation of P.I.

**Relationships**
- Safety / Respect / Trust
- Influence / Voice
- Flexibility
- Dialogue and Listening / Mutual Learning
- Conflict Management
- Leadership
- Self & Collective Reflection / Reflexivity
- Resource Management
- Participatory Decision-Making
- Task Roles Recognized
- Commitment to Collective Empowerment

**Intervention & Research**
- Processes that honor community and cultural knowledge & voice, fit local settings, and use both academic & community language lead to Culture-Centered Interventions
- Empowering Co-Learning Processes lead to Partnership Synergy
- Community Members Involved in Research Activities leads to Research/Evaluation Design that Reflects Community Priorities
- Bidirectional Translation, Implementation, Dissemination

**Outcomes**
- Intermediate System & Capacity Outcomes
  - Policy Environment: University & Community Changes
  - Sustainable Partnerships and Projects
  - Empowerment - Multi-Level
  - Shared Power Relations in Research /
    Knowledge Democracy
  - Cultural Reinforcement / Revitalization
  - Growth in Individual Partner & Agency Capacities
  - Research Productivity: Research Outcomes,
    Papers, Grant Applications & Awards
- Long-Term Outcomes: Social Justice
  - Community / Social Transformation: Policies & Conditions
  - Improved Health / Health Equity

Visual from amoshealth.org 2017
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RIH Promising Practices, Duran et al, in press</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Partnership Capacity**: Project has what it needs to work effectively towards its aims

**Shared CBPR Principles and Values**: Equitable partnerships builds on strengths of partners

**Community Involved in all Stages of Research**: CERI Index

**Influence**: Partners believe they have impact on the partnership

**Leadership**: Perception of PI skills

**Resource Management**: Appropriate use of financial & in-kind resources

**Written Agreement**: Formal agreements helpful

**Control of Resources**: Shared control and “mostly community” best

**Bridging Social Capital**: Capacity of academic team to connect with community

**Collective Empowerment (from E2)**: Influence/Community Voice; Collective Reflection; Community Fit; CBPR Principles
Collective Empowerment Preliminary Data Analysis

2nd wave of internet surveys (2015-2020)
179 partnerships/ 381 respondents to Internet Survey
Psychometrics validated/2 Pathway Models: Relational and Structural

Collective Empowerment:
Collective Reflection
Fit to Community
Influence/Agency
Shared CBPR Principles
Synergy for Action
System/ Capacity and Future Outcomes

Resonates with Freire’s “Conscientization”
Historical consciousness to join collective action
Tools from Engage for Equity
https://engageforequity.org

- River of Life/Historical Timeline
- Visioning with the CBPR Model
- Surveys, Interviews, Focus Groups
- Partnership Data Report
- Promising Practices Guide
To be a good educator (researcher) "means above all to have faith in people; to believe in the possibility that they can create and change things."

Paulo Freire, 1970
Promising Practices of CBPR and Community Engaged Research Partnerships

E² Engage for Equity

A National Study of Community and Academic Partnerships

Think Tank of Community and Academic CBPR Practitioners
Now Your Turn: Re-Create Your CBPR Model

Adapted from Wallerstein et al, 2008 & Wallerstein and Duran, 2010

Visual from amoshealth.org 2017
Start with Outcomes

Adapted from Wallerstein et al, 2008 & Wallerstein and Duran, 2010

Outcomes

Intermediate
- Policy Environment
- Sustained Partnership
- Empowerment
- Shared Power Relations in Research
- Cultural Reinforcement
- Individual/Agency Capacity
- Research Productivity

Long-term
- Community Transformation
- Social Justice
- Health / Health Equity

Intermediate System & Capacity Outcomes
- Policy Environment: University and Community Changes
- Sustainable Partnerships and Projects
- Empowerment – Multi-Level
- Shared Power Relations in Research / Knowledge Democracy
- Cultural Reinforcement / Revitalization
- Growth in Individual Partner & Agencies Capacities
- Research Productivity: Research Outcomes, Papers, Grant Applications & Awards

Long-Term Outcomes: Social Justice
- Community / Social Transformation: Policies & Conditions
- Improved Health / Health Equity
Think about Contexts

Adapted from Wallerstein et al, 2008 & Wallerstein and Duran, 2010

- Social-Structural: Social-Economic Status, Place, History, Environment, Community Safety, Institutional Racism, Culture
- Role of Education and Research Institutions
- Political & Policy: National / Local Governance / Stewardship / Approvals of Research; Policy & Funding Trends
- Health Issue: Perceived Severity
- Collaboration: Historic Trust / Mistrust between Partners
- Capacity: Community History of Organizing / Academic Capacity / Partnership Capacity
Think about Partnering Processes: What’s working / What needs strengthening

**Contexts**
- Social & Structural
- Political & Policy
- Health Issue Importance
- Capacity & Readiness
- Collaboration Trust & Mistrust

**Partnership Processes**
- **Partnership Structures**
  - CBOs
  - Funders
  - Community
  - Government
  - Health Care
- **Relationships**
  - Agency
  - Academic

**Partnership Processes**
- **Partnership Structures**
  - Diversity: Who is involved
  - Complexity
  - Formal Agreements
  - Control of Resources
  - % Dollars to Community
  - CBPR Principles
  - Partnership Values
  - Bridging Social Capital
  - Time in Partnership

- **Individual Characteristics**
  - Motivation to Participate
  - Cultural Identities/Humility
  - Personal Beliefs/Values
  - Spirituality
  - Reputation of P.I.

- **Relationships**
  - Safety / Respect / Trust
  - Influence / Voice
  - Flexibility
  - Dialogue & Listening/Mutual Learning
  - Conflict Management
  - Leadership
  - Collective Reflection/Reflexivity
  - Resource Management
  - Participatory Decision-making
  - Task Roles Recognized

**Commitment to Culture-Centeredness**
What are your actions/interventions/programs/research now? What do you want them to be? (how well do you involve community?)

**Intervention & Research**
- Processes that honor community and cultural knowledge and voice, fit local settings, and use both academic & community language lead to Culture-Centered Interventions
- Empowering Co-Learning Processes lead to Partnership Synergy
- Community Members Involved in Research Activities leads to Research/Evaluation Designs that Reflect Community Priorities
- Bidirectional Translation, Implementation & Dissemination
Australia: Oral Health Partnership
Teeth Tales Conceptual Model 2014 adapted from Wallerstein et al

**Context**
- Cultural & linguistic diversity
- Community health
- Priority health issue
- Oral health inequity
- Barriers to care
- Commitment to CBPR*
- Funding model for dental care

**Partnerships**
- Existing partnerships between some organisations
- New partnerships formed
- Organisations seeking research partnerships
- Project budgets, staffing & resources shared across organisations
- Joint funding submissions

**Research**
- Exploratory qualitative research
- Development of intervention framework
- Pilot study
- Exploratory trial
  - CORE
  - Screening
  - Peer-led community oral health education program

**Outcomes**
- Contribution to evidence base
- Evidence about child oral health knowledge & behaviours
- Oral health peer educators
- Community outreach oral health care
- Increased tooth brushing
- Child oral health education manual
- Clinical guidelines
- Guidelines for organisational cultural competency (CORE)
- Increased research capacity of community partners
- Increased cultural competence of researchers
- Increased organisational cultural competency
- Dissemination of findings
- Ongoing partnerships

*CBPR = Community based participatory research


E2 Workshop, 2017:
Community Action to Promote Healthy Environments
Social Development for Urban Youth

Context:
- Diversity: African-American, Haitian immigrant, central/south American immigrant
- Lower-income, middle-income
- Values/issue, community, sharing, teamwork, self-esteem, improve QoL
- Different research experience (participant, consumer, researcher)

NIMH funding

Partnership Dynamics:
- Kreyol, Spanish, English
- Hierarchy within partner org.
- 1-hour distance between sites
- 4-year partnership, community initiated
- Consensus decision-making
- Youth, parent, teacher, administrator, academic

Social curriculum to implement throughout all classes

Outcomes:
- 2 planned papers - process & QoL outcomes
- Conference presentations - academic + music education
- Develop further questions for research
- Empower youth, families, and teachers to influence organization/structure

Integrate mental health + music activities
- Library developed 6/4 partners
- Design influenced by partners and funders (e.g., RCT)
- Intervention setting & focus co-determined
- Intention to disseminate w/in community and academia

CBPR Institute, UNM, 2016